

Inequalities and the world of work

Conceptual Definitions and Key Terms

Table of contents

1	Definitions	2
1.1	Defining the world of work	2
1.2	Defining forms of work	4
1.3	Defining inequality	5
1.4	Inequalities in the world of work	6
1.4.1	Income Inequality	6
1.4.2	Other forms of inequality	6
1.4.3	The scale of inequalities	8
1.4.4	COVID-19 influence	8
1.5	Outcomes of inequalities	8
1.5.1	Inequalities' impact on employment outcomes	9
2	ILO Policy typology	9
2.1	Policy areas	10
2.2	Employment creation	12
2.3	Equal access to education/training/quality public services from early childhood	12
2.4	Adequate protection of all workers and a fair share of the fruits of growth	12
2.5	Transition to the formal economy	12
2.6	Gender equality and non-discrimination, equality for all, diversity and inclusion	12
2.7	Trade and development for a fair globalization and shared prosperity	13
2.8	Universal and adequate social protection	13
3	Search Protocol	13
3.1	Inclusion criteria	13
3.2	Tagging system	14
3.3	Matrix extraction properties	14
3.4	Search Term clusters	17
3.4.1	World-of-work cluster	17
3.4.2	forms of work cluster	17
3.4.3	LM outcome cluster	17
3.4.4	intervention cluster	18
3.4.5	policy cluster	18
3.4.6	inequality cluster	19
3.4.7	vertical inequalities cluster	19
3.4.8	horizontal inequalities cluster	20
4	Notes on previous reviews	21
4.1	Perez2022	21
4.2	Zeinali2021	21
4.3	Pinto2021	21
4.4	Finlay2001	22
4.5	Chaudhuri2021	22
4.6	Chang2021	22
4.7	Silvaggi2020	23
4.8	dePaz-Banez2020	23

4.9	Lindsay2018a	23
4.10	Kumari2018	23
4.11	Ugur2017	24
4.12	Lettieri2017	24
4.13	Taukobong2016	24
4.14	Ruhindwa2016	25
4.15	Kirsh2016	25
4.16	Hastbacka2016	25
4.17	Nevala2015	25
5	Database Query	26
5.1	Other reviews queried databases	26
5.2	WOS	26
6	Findings and Updates from query	30
6.1	Preliminary source pool	30
6.2	Additional concept research	30
6.3	Preliminary findings income	30
6.4	Potential additional search terms	31
6.5	Issues raised by ILO	31
7	Relevant references	32

1 Definitions

1.1 Defining the world of work

Work “any activity performed by persons of any sex and age to produce goods or to provide services for use by others or for own use” (ILO, 2013, p. 2).

“Work is defined irrespective of its formal or informal character or the legality of the activity” (ILO, 2013, p. 2).

Employment those in employment are “of working age who, during a reference period, were engaged in any activity to produce goods or provide services for pay or profit” (ILO, 2013, p. 6).

“For pay or profit refers to work done as part of a transaction in exchange for remuneration payable in the form of wages or salaries for time worked or work done, or in the form of profits derived from the goods and services produced through market transactions” (ILO, 2013, p. 6).

key concepts

production of goods

production/processing/collection of agricultural, fishing, hunting, gathering, mining, forestry, water, household goods, effecting major repairs/building additions to dwelling, farm buildings, etc.

key concepts

provision of services	provision of accounting, management, transport, meal preparation/serving, waste disposal/recycling, cleaning, decorating, dwelling/goods maintenance, childcare/-instruction, elderly/dependent person/pet/domestic animal care
use by others or own-use	whether final products are destined <i>mainly</i> for final use by producer as capital formation or final consumption, or by others
for pay or profit	as part of transaction in exchange for remuneration (wages/salary), or in form of profits from goods/services through market transactions

Informal economy “economic activities carried out by workers and economic units that are — in law or in practice — not covered or insufficiently covered by formal arrangements.” (ILO, 2002, p. 14; 2015, pp. 4, 25)

“all remunerative work [...] that is not registered, regulated or protected by existing legal or regulatory frameworks, as well as non-remunerative work undertaken in an income-producing enterprise.” (?)

“does not cover illicit activities, in particular the provision of services or the production, sale, possession or use of goods forbidden by law” (ILO, 2015, p. 4)

Formal economy sufficiently covered by formal arrangements, defined as “procedures established by the government to regulate the actions and functions of economic units and workers, as well as protecting their legal rights.” [ILO, 2021, p.10]

Informal employment *outside the informal sector* comprises employees holding informal jobs in formal sector enterprises, as paid domestic workers employed by households, contributing family workers working in formal sector enterprises, and own-account workers producing exclusively for own final use by their household (ILO, 2023a)

Labour underutilization are “mismatches between labour supply and demand which translate into an unmet need for employment among the population” (ILO, 2013, p. 9)

can be “*time-related underemployment*, when the working time of persons in employment is insufficient in relation to alternative employment situations in which they are willing and available to engage” (ILO, 2013, p. 9)

can be “*unemployment*, reflecting an active job search by persons not in employment” (ILO, 2013, p. 9)

can be “*potential labour force*, [those] not in employment who express an interest in this form

of work but for whom existing conditions limit their active job search and/or their availability.”
(ILO, 2013, p. 9)

key concepts	
remuneration	see ‘for pay or profit’ above
formal arrangements	protection of legal rights, regulation of actions/functions of economic units
legality of activity	while concept of ‘work’ covers activities regardless of illicit status, informal economy excludes illicit activities
utilization of labor	described various states of labour supply and demand mismatch such as unemployment, time-related underemployment, and potential labour force

1.2 Defining forms of work

“five mutually exclusive forms of work are identified for separate measurement” (ILO, 2013, p. 3)

own-use production work comprising production of goods and services for own final use

“all those of working age who, during a short reference period, performed any activity to produce goods or provide services for own final use.” (ILO, 2013, p. 5)

employment work comprising work performed for others in exchange for pay or profit

“all those of working age who, during a short reference period, were engaged in any activity to produce goods or provide services for pay or profit” (ILO, 2013, p. 6)

unpaid trainee work comprising work performed for others without pay to acquire workplace experience or skills

“all those of working age who, during a short reference period, performed any unpaid activity to produce goods or provide services for others, in order to acquire workplace experience or skills in a trade or profession” (ILO, 2013, p. 7)

volunteer work comprising non-compulsory work performed for others without pay

“all those of working age who, during a short reference period, performed any unpaid, non-compulsory activity to produce goods or provide services for others”

other work activities not defined in this resolution

key concepts	
intensity of participation	how many hours/days work occupies in a certain time frame
own-use/other-use	see above
for pay or profit	see above

1.3 Defining inequality

Vertical inequality “income inequality between all households in a country” (ILO, 2021b)

“the debate on vertical inequalities has increasingly focused on how, in many countries, the richest 1 per cent or the top 10 per cent of income earners have improved their situation compared to the poorest 99 per cent or bottom 90 per cent.” (ILO, 2021a)

Horizontal inequality “Horizontal inequalities occur when some groups within the population find themselves disadvantaged and discriminated against on the basis of their visible identity, for example their gender, colour or beliefs, among others” (ILO, 2021a)

“public attention has increasingly been devoted to racial or ethnic inequalities, and to the rifts between migrants and nationals.”

“Spatial inequalities between rural and urban areas and, more recently, between large megacities and smaller, more peripheral, cities have also been studied with increasing concern”

“also refers to disparities in employment outcomes, labour rights and opportunities between groups depending on their gender, age, nationality, ethnicity, health status, disability or other characteristics”

Intersectionality “captures the complex way in which inequalities based on different personal characteristics overlap and accumulate [and] particular dynamics of inequality appear where people belong to multiple disadvantaged groups.” (ILO, 2021a)

Equality of opportunities “seeks to level the playing field so that gender, ethnicity, birthplace, family background and other characteristics that are beyond an individual’s control do not influence or harm a person’s future perspective” (ILO, 2021a)

“ensuring that all people are ‘equally enabled to make the best of such powers as they possess’ ” (ILO, 2021a)

Equality of outcomes “a focus on opportunities [...] should not distract from the importance of observed inequality of outcomes.” (ILO, 2021a)

“high levels of inequality make it much more difficult to ensure equal opportunities for the next generation [since] high levels of inequality today tend to reduce social mobility tomorrow.” (ILO, 2021a)

key concepts

within-group/between-group inequality	the horizontal or vertical nature of inequality, existing as income inequality between all households in a country (vertical) or when some population groups are disadvantaged/discriminated against (horizontal)
overlapping characteristics	all inequalities can be intersectional through individuals' overlapping disadvantaged characteristics or situations
enabling of opportunity/outcome equality	two philosophies of seeking equality, by either providing a 'level playing field' (opportunity) or ensuring equality in the resulting situations (outcome)

Missing:

- difference between relative and absolute inequality (see Ravallion (2018), 637)

1.4 Inequalities in the world of work

1.4.1 Income Inequality

- main focus point of many inequality measurements (e.g. Gini Coefficient, Palma Ratio) [UN, 2023, A call to action to save SDG10, Policy Brief]
- “labour income is the main source of income for most households in the world [thus] unequal access to work and working poverty are major drivers of inequalities” (ILO, 2021b)
- “Income inequality, inequality of employment outcomes more generally and inequality of opportunities are intimately related” (ILO, 2022a)
- “To some extent, therefore, income inequality is like a prism, which reveals many other forms of inequality, including those generated in the world of work” (ILO, 2021a, p. 13).
- “Throughout the world, earnings inequality is also determined by a set of other factors, including status in employment (whether a worker is a wage employee or self-employed), sector of activity and occupation, enterprise type, type of contract (for wage earners), and often formality” (ILO, 2019).

1.4.2 Other forms of inequality

Inequalities are always multi-faceted, complex and display intersectional qualities (ILO, 2021a):

1.4.2.1 Gender inequality

These are inequalities that arise because of an individual's gender:

- while type and extent of inequalities varies by country, “gender inequalities, despite some progress over the past decades, remain persistent and pervasive” (ILO, 2021b).
- “women everywhere still face high barriers in entering, remaining and progressing in the labour market, while continuing to bear most of the responsibility for unpaid care work” (ILO, 2022a).
- “hinders not only access to education, training and lifelong learning, but also access to quality jobs, housing, mobility, land and capital, as well as social protection” (ILO, 2021b).
- more women, globally, work in underemployment, contribute disproportionately to family work, work shorter hours in employment but have longer working days when including unpaid work, are increasingly employed in services sectors, and still suffer a substantial wage gap (ILO, 2016)
- “Domestic work is female-dominated, with women accounting for 76.2 per cent of domestic workers” and domestic work, in turn is overwhelmingly informal employment globally (ILO, 2023b, p. 6).
- “Disparities in the gendered division of unpaid care work and paid work are the result of deeply rooted inequalities based on gender roles, income, age, education and place of residence” (ILO, 2019).

1.4.2.2 Socio-demographic inequalities

These are inequalities that, like gender inequality, are based on the innate, often visible, identification of a person.

Examples are: ethnic, racial inequalities, or those based on religion and beliefs, migrant status, age, sex, or disabilities. (ILO, 2021a, pp. 11–12)

- “the incidence of temporary employment is generally higher among youths” (ILO, 2019).
- “Women and young people fare significantly worse in labour markets, an indication of the large inequalities within the world of work in many countries.” (ILO, 2023c)
- “In the EU28, some 7% of workers felt they had been discriminated against in the 12 months prior to the survey on grounds of sex, race, religion, age, nationality, disability or sexual orientation” (ILO, 2019).

1.4.2.3 Spatial inequality

These are inequalities that arise because of an individual's location relative to others:

- “between urban, rural and peripheral areas and richer and poorer regions [...] contribute to inequalities in the world of work, as well as to a growing sense of fractured societies” (ILO, 2021b)
- due to “unequal access to economic and decent work opportunities, to finance, quality public services, quality education and relevant training, essential social services infrastructures and digital infrastructure” (ILO, 2021b)

1.4.2.4 Pre-existing inequalities

These are inequalities that exist *before* the labor market enters the picture for an individual and, while intertwined with socio-demographic inequalities, may be useful to differentiate:

- “some inequalities arise well before individuals enter the world of work and addressing them is key to reducing inequalities in the labour market and beyond” (ILO, 2021a)
- “inequality in household incomes [...] reflects many other correlated or underlying forms of inequality [such as] inequality of opportunity, or inequality of access to health services or education, for example.” (ILO, 2021a, p. 13)
- “the world of work plays an important role in reducing inequalities, including in terms of intergenerational social mobility” (ILO, 2021b)
- “they also relate to the characteristics [...] such as the level of education, poverty or productivity and, of course, their underlying factors.” (ILO, 2021a)
- “underlying factors are numerous and include the lack of formal recognition as an individual (the lack of a birth certificate or identity card), the lack of property rights or of clear ownership of assets, or the lack of access to formal banking, all of which are both a form of inequality and increase other forms of inequality.” (ILO, 2021a)

1.4.3 The scale of inequalities

- globally, between countries (vertical)
- national inequalities, between all households in one country (vertical)
- regional, between urban/rural divides; poor/rich regions (horizontal: spatial)
- households, between households with different access to education/essential services/infrastructures (horizontal: spatial)
- individuals, between persons based on (visible/invisible) characteristics (horizontal: gender, spatial, pre-existing, ...)

1.4.4 COVID-19 influence

- “[Post COVID-19] recovery patterns vary significantly across regions, countries and sectors [and] the impact has been particularly serious for developing nations that experienced higher levels of inequality, more divergent working conditions and weaker social protection systems even before the pandemic.” (ILO, 2022b)
- “The pandemic is deepening various forms of inequality, from exacerbating gender inequity to widening the digital divide.” (ILO, 2022b)

1.5 Outcomes of inequalities

- “[inequalities] slow economic growth and poverty reduction, undermine social mobility and increase the risk of social unrest and political instability [as well as] contribute to the intergenerational transmission of poverty and social exclusion” (ILO, 2022a)

- “forms of inequality can be also among the root causes of child labour and forced or compulsory labour in all its forms.” (ILO, 2021b)

1.5.1 Inequalities’ impact on employment outcomes

- **unemployment:** forecloses income prospects
- **underemployment:**
 - low wages make meeting basic needs impossible (esp. food, healthcare, education, decent housing)
 - split into ‘time-related underemployment’ (wanting more hourly paid work) and ‘potential labour force’ (not actively looking or not able to work)
- **inequality of job quality** (achievement of decent work)
 - “concerns first and foremost those working in the informal economy”, who may experience reduced social protection, productivity, job security, wages and earnings (ILO, 2021a)
 - “many are in forms of work, such as part-time work, fixed-term contracts and working through private employment agencies, that can offer a stepping stone to employment [but] may give rise to decent work deficits when, among other reasons, they are not regulated well” or used to circumvent legal obligations or without adequate labour/social protection (ILO, 2021b)
 - “Job quality features are also positively associated with enterprise performance, productivity and innovation, [...] reducing sickness absence and the loss of productivity due to working while sick. In addition, job quality contributes to developing organisational commitment and motivation among workers, as well as shaping a climate that is supportive of creativity and the development of the workforce” (ILO, 2019).
- other employment outcomes affected:
 - overall labor force participation: exclusion from labour market or the ability towards full utilization of labour market opportunities (ILO, 2019, 2021a)
 - ultimately resulting in income inequalities, in turn becoming driver of subsequent unequal outcomes and barriers in the labour market (as well as outside the labour market), reducing inter-generational social mobility (ILO, 2021b)

2 ILO Policy typology

identified in ILO (2021b) and ILO (2022a):

- attention to root causes
- addressing both distribution and redistribution
 - original distribution highly affected by inequalities on labour market
 - preventing both vertical/horizontal inequalities requires redistribution through taxes and transfers
- fundamental principles and rights and international labour standards

- social dialogue and tripartism
- interconnectedness, integration and monitoring
- country-specific approaches

2.1 Policy areas

guiding principles

main policy areas identified ([ILO, 2022a](#)):

Policy *areas*, identified by ILO ([2022a](#)):

- employment creation
- business sustainability promotion
 - pro-employment framework
 - gender-transformative framework
 - promote:
 - * business sustainability
 - * productivity increases
 - * reduction in productivity gaps
 - digital infrastructure
 - technology for decent work
 - tackling digital divide
- access to education
 - quality of education/training/skills development
 - relevance of education/training/skills development
 - green transition
 - digital transition
 - gender-transformative career guidance
 - improvements of public services/social protection
 - work-life balance (‘juggle paid work and family care’)
 - targeted support for disadvantaged groups
- labour right protection
 - promotion of rights for all workers
 - minimum wage
 - collective bargaining systems
 - equal pay for work of equal value
 - wage transparency
 - inclusive labour market institutions
- formalization
 - approaching informality:
 - * gender-responsive

- * country-tailored
 - * comprehensive
 - * non-discriminatory
- increase decent work in formal economy
- absorb informal workers / economic units
- gender equality
 - removal of stereotypes
 - removal of discriminatory law
 - removal of discriminatory practice
 - promotion of equality of treatment
 - promotion of equality of opportunity
 - data disaggregated by
 - * gender
 - * age
 - * disability
 - * race
 - * ethnicity
 - * migrant status
 - occupational gender segregation
 - unequal pay for work of equal value
 - gender-based violence
 - gender-based harassment
 - gender unequal division of unpaid care work
- trade development
 - avoid severe economic fluctuations
 - ensure price stability
 - promotion of high volume of trade
 - promotion of steady volume of trade
 - fundamental principles and rights at work
 - responsible business practices
- social protection
 - extend reach of social protection schemes
 - reach those not adequately protected
 - ensure access for everyone to:
 - * comprehensive SP
 - * adequate SP
 - * sustainable SP

2.2 Employment creation

- pro-employment, gender-transformative macroeconomic framework
- enabling business environment promoting sustainable enterprise, productivity increases, reductions in productivity gaps
- digital infrastructure investments for potential of technology for decent work and tackling digital divide
- just transition minimizing impacts of environmental changes on employment
- effective active labour market policies enabling employment for vulnerable and disadvantaged

2.3 Equal access to education/training/quality public services from early childhood

- improvements to quality and relevance of education, training, skills development
- responsive to labour market needs, changing WoW demands, green/digital transitions, demographic changes
- gender-transformative career guidance on e.g. STEM
- improvements to quality of public services, social protection to juggle paid work & family care
- targeted support for disadvantaged groups

2.4 Adequate protection of all workers and a fair share of the fruits of growth

- promotion of fundamental principles and rights at work for all workers
- adequate minimum wage (Minimum Wage Fixing Convention, 1970, No 131)
- implementation of collective bargaining systems
- equal pay for work of equal value, wage transparency
- effective/inclusive labour market institutions, e.g. relevant inspectorates

2.5 Transition to the formal economy

- comprehensive, country-tailored, gender-responsive, non-discriminatory strategies tackling drivers of informality
- combination of interventions increasing ability of formal economy to provide decent work opportunities, absorption of current informal workers & economic units
- strengthening ability of people/enterprises to enter formal economy through incentives and elimination of barriers

2.6 Gender equality and non-discrimination, equality for all, diversity and inclusion

- removal of stereotypes, discriminatory laws and practices, including at workplace

- promotion of positive/transformational measures ensuring equality of treatment&opportunities
- more available data disaggregated by gender,age,disability,race,ethnicity,migrant status to monitor policy impacts
- combined policy responses within/-out labour market against: occupational gender segregation, unequal pay for work of equal value, gender-based violence/harassment, gender unequal division of unpaid care work

2.7 Trade and development for a fair globalization and shared prosperity

- full cooperation with relevant international bodies to avoid severe economic fluctuations, ensure price stability
- promotion of high and steady volume of intl. trade
- promotion/application of fundamental principles and rights at work through trade agreements/in supply chains, alongside responsible business practices

2.8 Universal and adequate social protection

- extension of reach of national social protection systems
- reach those not adequately protected
- ensure access for everyone to comprehensive, adequate, sustainable social protection over life cycle

3 Search Protocol

3.1 Inclusion criteria

Table 5: Study inclusion and exclusion scoping criteria {#tbl-inclusion-criteria}

Parameter	Inclusion criteria	Exclusion criteria
Time frame	study published in or after 2000	study published before 2000
Study type	primary research	opinion piece, editorial, commentary, news article, literature review
Study recency	most recent publication of study	gray literature superseded by white literature publication
Study data	evidence-based study or based on empirical approach	no empirical approach or not clearly based on evidential data
Study focus	effects on inequality/equality as primary outcome (dependent variable) policy measure or strategy as primary intervention (independent variable)	neither inequality nor equality outcomes as dependent variable no policy measure/strategy as intervention or relationship unclear

Table 5: Study inclusion and exclusion scoping criteria {#tbl-inclusion-criteria}

Parameter	Inclusion criteria	Exclusion criteria
	specifically relates to some dimension of world of work	exists outside world of work for both independent and dependent variables
	focus on dimension of inequality in analysis	no focus on mention of inequality in analysis

not currently used as criteria: - we are probably including qualitative studies (to be tagged) - perhaps studies <2000 (to be tagged) to count quantity?

3.2 Tagging system

Tagging:

- inequality(ies) analysed: `inequality::`
- intersectionality: `intersectional`
- intervention: `intervention::`
- outcome: `outcome::`
- review: `review::` (meta, systematic, scoping, narrative, ..)
- design: `design::` (qualitative, mixed, quasi-experimental, experimental)
- country: `country::`
- relevancy: `relevant, out::` (could be transformed to `excluded::` in end step)
- status: `TODO, done, integrated`

see Screening Tool document for exact keywords used during screening.

3.3 Matrix extraction properties

For up-to-date usage of extraction keys please see `extraction_template.yml` in data directory. Information kept here for full-text descriptions of each option, to be migrated to extraction metadata sheet.

Publication info	Description
author	
year	
title	
publisher	
pubtype	article/working paper - publication type
url/doi	
?discipline?	The overall discipline the study falls under

Context info	Description
country	What is the primary/are the primary country/countries under analysis in the study? (set:txt)
country_world_region	Which ILO region does the country belong to? (set:txt)
country_income_class	Which UN Bank income category does the country belong to? (set:txt)
period_of_analysis	What is the main period of analysis for the study (in years, e.g. 2010-2012)? (timedelta)
observation_length	What is the main length of observation for the study, if mentioned (in months)? (timedelta)
observation_length_max	What is the max length of observation for the study, if it diverges from the average length (in months)? (timedelta)
explicit_targeting	is intervention specifically (explicitly) targeted at population/group? (bool:0/1)
target_group	who is the intervention targeted at (explicitly/implicitly)? (list:txt)
data	What dataset/database/collection does the data stem from, if mentioned? (list:txt)

Results info	Description
interventions	what are the independent variables for the study? (list:txt)
intervention_institutional	Is the intervention part of the institutional category? (bool:0/1)
intervention_structural	Is the intervention part of the structural category? (bool:0/1)
intervention_agency	Is the intervention part of the agency and social norms category? (bool:0/1)
inequality_type	which inequalities/dimensions of inequality are objects of analysis for the study? (list:txt)
inequality_direction	Is the main inequality looked at of horizontal or vertical type? (0: vertical; 1: horizontal)
outcome_measures	what are the dependent variables looked at in the study? (list:txt)

Results info	Description
findings	what are the main findings for the dependent variables? (list:txt)
channels	What are the main channels for outcomes identified, if mentioned? (list:txt)
theory	What is the main theoretical argument/grounding for the study, if mentioned? (list:txt)
limitations	What are the main limitations of the study, if mentioned? (list:txt)

Statistical info	Description
study_design	Is the study mainly of experimental, quasi-experimental, qualitative, mixed design? (set:txt)
study_method	What is the main method of the study? (list:txt)
indicator_relative	Is the main indicator used relative or absolute? (0: absolute, 1: relative)
sample_size	What is the main sample size/observation number of the study? (numeric)
sample_unit	What is the main sample unit (person,household,firm, ...)? (txt)
representativeness	At what level is the study mainly representative? (national, subnational, rural, urban..) (list:txt)
direction	What is the main direction of relation between independent/dependent variables? (0: negative, 1: positive)
significance	What is the main level of statistical significance? (2: significant, 1: marginally significant, 0: non significant)

- annotation, quick 100-300wd written summary of major properties found above for each study
-> ~34 observations per study

3.4 Search Term clusters

These lists have been used to create data-driven term cluster files in the supplementary data directory. The lists have been kept here for historic documentation but should not be used for up-to-date term changes, use the csv files instead.

3.4.1 World-of-work cluster

- ILO:
 - work
 - production of goods, provision of services
 - use by others or own-use
 - regardless of legality
 - labour
 - production of goods, provision of services,
 - use by others
 - of working age
 - for pay or profit (remuneration, wages, salaries for time worked work done, profits derived from goods or services, through market transactions)

3.4.2 forms of work cluster

- ILO
 - own-use
 - employment
 - unpaid trainee
 - volunteer
 - other work activities
 - domestic
 - wage-employed
 - self-employed
 - formality
 - (unpaid) care work

3.4.3 LM outcome cluster

- ILO:
 - employment outcomes
 - labour rights
 - opportunities between groups
 - equality of opportunity/outcome

Finlay (2021):

- labour force participation (also, [Pinto et al., 2021](#))
- job quality
- career advancement
- hours worked

Silvaggi et al. ([2020](#)):

- labour force exit
- rereturning to work issues

3.4.4 intervention cluster

- general terms:
 - intervention ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - policy ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - distributive ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - redistributive ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - regulatory ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))

3.4.5 policy cluster

- institutional promotion:
 - institutional support for childcare ([Perez et al. \(2022\)](#))
 - labour rights ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - minimum wage ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - collective bargaining ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - employment creation ?? ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - business sustainability promotion ?? ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - work-life balance promotion ?? ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - equal pay for work of equal value ?? ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - removal of (discriminatory) law ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - law reformation ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - social dialogue (ILO requested)
 - guaranteed income ([Perez et al. \(2022\)](#))
 - universal basic income ([Perez et al. \(2022\)](#))
 - provision of living wage ([Perez et al. \(2022\)](#))
 - maternity leave ([Chang et al. \(2021\)](#))
- structural promotion:
 - cash benefits
 - services in kind
 - green transition ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))
 - digital infrastructure ([ILO \(2022a\)](#))

- (physical) infrastructure (ILO (2022a))
- quality of education (ILO (2022a))
- public service improvement (ILO (2022a))
- lowering of gender segregation (ILO (2022a))
- price stability intervention (ILO (2022a))
- extended social protection scheme (ILO (2022a))
- comprehensive social protection (ILO (2022a))
- sustainable social protection (ILO (2022a))
- supported employment (Lettieri & Diez Villoria (2017))
- vocational rehabilitation (Silvaggi et al. (2020), Lettieri & Diez Villoria (2017))
- unionization (ILO requested)
- agency & social norms:
 - credit programs (Perez et al. (2022))
 - career guidance (ILO (2022a))
 - vocational guidance (Nevala et al. (2015))
 - vocational counselling (Nevala et al. (2015))
 - counteracting of stereotypes (ILO (2022a))
 - commuting subsidies (Perez et al. (2022))
 - housing mobility programs (Perez et al. (2022))
 - encouraging re-situation/migration (Perez et al. (2022))
 - encouraging self-advocacy (Nevala et al. (2015))
 - cognitive behavioural therapy (Lettieri & Diez Villoria (2017))
 - computer-assisted therapy (Lettieri & Diez Villoria (2017))
 - work organization (Nevala et al. (2015))
 - special transportation (Nevala et al. (2015))
 - collective action (ILO requested)

3.4.6 inequality cluster

- ILO:
 - inequality/-ies
 - barrier(s)
 - (dis)advantaged
 - discriminated
 - disparity/-ies
 - horizontal / vertical inequality

3.4.7 vertical inequalities cluster

- income:
 - Palma ratio (DFI, 2023)

- Gini coefficient (DFI, 2023)
- Log deviation [our quant indicators]
- Theil [our quant indicators]
- Atkinson [our quant indicators]
- class Kalasa et al. (2021)
- fertility Kalasa et al. (2021)
- NOT identified by previous reviews, need to find sources:
 - bottom percentile
 - top percentile

3.4.8 horizontal inequalities cluster

identified by ILO:

- identity
- demographic inequalities
- demographic markers
- gender
- colour
- beliefs
- racial
- ethnic
- migrant
- spatial
 - rural
 - urban
 - mega-cities
 - small cities
 - peripheral cities
- age
- nationality
- ethnicity
- health status
- disability
- characteristics

4 Notes on previous reviews

4.1 Perez2022

summary: multi-disciplinary systematic review of association between income, employment, urban poverty. n=243 articles, academic focus on advanced economies; finds significant role of employment in life of urban poor;

findings: most relevant barriers for improving labour market outcomes: lack of access to public transport, geographical segregation, labour informality, inadequate human capital

(Perez et al., 2022) identify a multitude of factors which ultimately affect income, employment and urban poverty. Among them: gender inequality, through traditional gender roles and lack of empowerment, a lack of childcare, or unequal domestic work; low human capital, which can originate through pre-existing inequalities, spatial inequality, through lack of access to transportation, residential segregation or discrimination, limited access to work, the inter-generational persistence of poverty as well as the impacts of pre-existing inequalities such as lower human capital or larger household sizes;

and external factors such as extreme weather events or inflation.

Strategies to reduce poverty/unemployment are: participation in informal sectors or illegal activities, credit programs, consumption from informal food sources, family and institutional support for childcare, guaranteed minimum income or universal basic income and/or living wage, income diversification, commuting subsidies, housing mobility programs, and migration.

4.2 Zeinali2021

systematic review of female leadership in health sector (LMICs) using intersectional analysis

main findings: main barriers at intersection of gender and social identity of professional cadre, race/ethnicity, financial status, culture; main barriers limiting women's access to career development resources: mentorship, sponsorship opportunities, reduce value, recognition, respect at work for women; channels: increased likelihood for women to take on 'dual burdens' professional work and childcare/domestic work, biased views effectiveness of men/women's leadership styles.

4.3 Pinto2021

systematic review of impact of basic income interventions (n=86; 10 different interventions) on labour market, health, educational, housing and other outcomes

main findings: workforce participation was main dependent variable for studies, evaluation shift over time to include wider array of outcomes reflecting reigning perspective of BI investments possibly lowering health & social care spending; large focus on advanced economies (US)

4.4 Finlay2001

narrative review of connection between women's reproductive health and women's economic activity (and gender equality); looking at (causal) effect of fertility (timing, spacing, number of children) on female labour force participation changes (career advancement, job quality, hours worked); separation between LI,MI,HI countries

main findings:

- low-inc countries women have to adopt individual strategies of balancing child rearing and labour force part. through selection of job type, relying on other household women for childcare, birth spacing due to mostly informal work
- middle-inc countries women have to juggle child rearing, labour force part. with overall income inequality; early childbearing and lone motherhood perpetuate poverty
- high-inc countries, SP policies can assist women in managing childrearing and work balance but underlying issues of gender inequality remain
- all: childbearing interrupts career advancement

4.5 Chaudhuri2021

systematic review on effects of food insecurity (common byproduct of poverty) on health and social outcomes, focusing on women and children

main findings: - female coping behaviours are non-food (livelihood alterations: outdoor employment, asset base selling, borrowing food/money, purchasing food on credit) or food-based (reducing daily intake sizes/frequency, food rationing; nutritional switch; food sharing); - (obligatory) outdoor employment mostly as farm labourers, can result in time poverty - children coping behaviours are begging, stealing, food seeking (with relatives/friends/charitable institutions), dropping out of school - health outcome includes disrupted socio-cognitive development among children

4.6 Chang2021

systematic qualitative review of effects of return to paid employment and breast-feeding (n=26)

main findings: women experienced physical and emotional difficulties, described gender and employment inequalities in accessing and receiving the support they needed; importance of having workplace legislation in place (and individual motivation) to facilitate breastfeeding during employment; support from employers/colleagues/family members & access to convenient child care helped facilitate breast feeding on return to paid employment

channels: - gender role expectations viewing women as responsible for domestic work or childcare (especially in LMICs) - shorter maternity leave times discourage decision towards breast-feeding

4.7 Silvaggi2020

systematic review looking at effect of brain tumors on on work ability of those affected (and BT survivors) (n=7)

main findings: impact of neuropsychological functioning on work productivity, change of employment status for long-term survivors (?most often? job loss), issues related to return to work process

channels: depressive symptoms/cognitive deficits, high short-term mortality, environmental barriers

policy recc: vocational rehabilitation

4.8 dePaz-Banez2020

systematic review of effects of UBI on labour supply (n=38)

main finding: not found any evidence of significant reduction in labour supply, instead labour supply increases globally among adults, men, women, young, old; some insignificant (functional) reductions for: children, elderly, sick, those with disabilities, women with young children to look after, young people who continued studying - do not reduce overall supply since offset by otherwise increased supply

4.9 Lindsay2018a

systematic review of role of gender in employment for disabled young adults (n=48)

main finding: - majority (21) reported young men with disabilities better employment outcomes than women, fewer (8) showed reverse, minority (5) reported no difference - men with disabilities often work more hours and have higher wages - youth with disabilities half as likely to be employed as typically developing peers; starting life with disability often compounds disadvantages

channels: - social supports - gender role expectations - lowered expectations - overprotection from parents/guardians discouraging independence

4.10 Kumari2018

systematic review looking at relationship of female labour force participation and economic growth, gender disparity in work participation

main findings: U-shaped part. rate; evidence of gender pay disparity across sectors

channels affecting FLFP: - demographic factors (fertility, migration, marriages, child care) - economic factors (unemployment, per capita income, non-farm job, infrastructure) - regulatory context (family and childcare policies, tax regimes, presence of subsidized healthcare)

policy recc: changes to FLFP require replacement of traditional value system based on inequality of sexes (with females playing subordinate role)

4.11 Ugur2017

systematic review of effects of technology adoption on employment (in LMIC/LIC ‘less developed countries’)

main findings: positive effect more likely when technology adoption favours product innovation not process innovation and when it is skill based

additional: - techn. adoption *less* likely to create employment when: related to farm employment not firm/industry employment; related to low-income countries not LMICs; related to data from after 2001 instead of pre-2001 - intl trade, weak forward/backward linkages, weaknesses in governance & labor market institutions can weak job-creating effects of technology adoption

inequality: - existing income inequalities makes effect of technology adoption on employment creation more ambiguous (potentially widening rift of demand for skilled versus unskilled labour) - green revolution technologies tend to reduce income/wealth inequality; also negative effect on on-farm employment

4.12 Lettieri2017

meta-review of barriers (and drivers) of inclusion into the labour market for people with disabilities (mental illness)

main findings: employment outcomes seem increased for individuals able to hide their mental illness, practice of concealment of identity

channels: - prejudices: of missing skills, danger, unpredictability; of hiring as act of charity due to being unproductive; of work stress as contradicting requirements of mental health - discriminatory hiring practices - generally low-skilled individuals due to discrimination/cultural/social barriers for training and work inclusion

policy rec: - supported employment (environmental) - cognitive behavioural/computer-assisted therapies (cognitive) - vocational rehabilitation programs (human capital)

4.13 Taukobong2016

(narrative?) review of effects of dimensions of female ‘empowerment’ on health outcomes and development outcomes, such as access to and use of financial services

main findings: - gender inequalities highly contextual (and intersectional), requires identification of variations at start of interventions where inequalities exist, overlap and work as barriers to its implementation - strong association with improved outcomes across multiple outcome sectors: control over income/assets/resources, decision-making power, education - relation with health/family planning outcomes: mobility, personal safety, equitable interpersonal relationships

4.14 Ruhindwa2016

(narrative) review of barriers to workforce inclusion (paid/volunteer work) for people with disabilities; summary of findings

main findings: - “effective practice takes an inclusive approach and allows clients to take ownership of solutions in relation to addressing the challenges they experience in the employment sector”

policy recc: - employment support practices - campaigns to encourage disclosing disability

4.15 Kirsh2016

review of factors influencing LM outcomes of supported employment interventions for people with disabilities

main findings: - most employment support literature only looks at overall efficacy of interventions, with little prudence for intersectional inequality variations

inequalities: - men more likely to be employed (argue possibly due to manual labour of many jobs)
- older people less likely to be employed (age+, change-) - older women more likely to be employed than men - education very important in employment outcomes

policy recc: - vocational rehabilitation

4.16 Hastbacka2016

scoping review of linkages between societal participation and people with disabilities for identity of participant, type of participation, type of facilitators and barriers; focus on European countries (n=32, between 2012-2013)

main findings: strongest focus on labour market participation; social participation viewed through lens of disabled people as one group instead of intersectional

main barriers: financial factors, attitudes, health issues, unemployment main facilitators: legislation and disability policies; support from people in close contact with disabled people, attitudes in society and employment opportunities for people with disabilities

4.17 Nevala2015

systematic review looking at effectiveness of workplace accommodation (vocational counselling/guidance, education/self-advocacy, help of others, changes in work schedules, work organization, special transportation) on employment, work ability, cost-benefit, rtw (n=11)

main findings: - moderate evidence that employment among physically disabled persons promoted by: vocational counselling/guidance, education/self-advocacy, help of others, changes in work schedules, work organisation, special transportation - low evidence that rtw increased for physical/cognitive disabilities by: liaison (btw employer and other professionals), education, work aids, work techniques

barrier/facilitators: self-advocacy, support of employer and community, amount of training/counselling, flexibility of work schedules/organisation

5 Database Query

5.1 Other reviews queried databases

from Pinto et al. (2021):

- Scopus
- Embase
- Medline
- CINAHL
- WOS
- ProQuest
- EBSCOhost Research DB
- PsycINFO

5.2 WOS

```
TS=
(
  (
    work OR
    labour OR
    production of goods OR
    provision of services OR
    own-use OR
    use by others OR
    of working age OR
    for pay OR
    for profit OR
    remuneration OR
    market transactions
  ) AND
  (
    (
      own-use OR
      employment OR
      unpaid trainee OR
      volunteer OR
```

```
other work activities OR
wage-employed OR
self-employed OR
formal work OR
informal work OR
domestic work OR
care work OR
unpaid work
) OR
(
employment outcomes OR
labour rights OR
equality of oppoertunity OR
equality of outcome OR
labour force participationOR
labour force exit OR
job quality OR
career advancement OR
hours worked OR
wage OR
salary OR
return to work
)
)
) AND
TS=
(
(
intervention OR
policy OR
participation OR
targeting/targeted OR
distributive OR
redistributive
)
AND
(
(
```

support for childcare OR
labour rights OR
minimum wage OR
collective bargaining OR
business sustainability promotion OR
work-life balance promotion OR
equal pay for work of equal value OR
removal of (discriminatory) law OR
law reformation OR
guaranteed income OR
universal basic income OR
provision of living wage OR
maternity leave

)

OR

(

cash benefits OR
services in kind OR
green transition OR
infrastructure OR
digital infrastructure OR
quality of education OR
public service improvement OR
lowering of gender segregation OR
price stability intervention OR
extended social protection scheme OR
comprehensive social protection OR
sustainable social protection OR
supported employment OR
vocational rehabilitation

)

OR

(

credit programs OR
career guidance OR
vocational guidance OR
vocational counselling OR
counteracting of stereotypes OR
commuting subsidies OR

```
housing mobility programs OR
encouraging re-situation/migration OR
encouraging self-advocacy OR
cognitive behavioural therapy OR
computer-assisted therapy OR
work organization OR
special transportation
)
)
) AND
```

TS=

```
(
(
inequality OR
inequalities OR
barriers OR
advantaged OR
disadvantaged OR
discriminated OR
disparity OR
disparities
)
NEAR/5
(
(
income OR
"Palma ratio" OR
"Gini coefficient" OR
class OR
fertility OR
"bottom percentile" OR
"top percentile"
)
OR
(
identity OR
demographic OR
gender OR
```

```
colour OR
beliefs OR
racial OR
ethnic OR
migrant OR
spatial OR
rural OR
urban OR
mega-cities OR
"small cities" OR
"peripheral cities" OR
age OR
nationality OR
ethnicity OR
"health status" OR
disability OR
characteristics
)
)
)
```

6 Findings and Updates from query

6.1 Preliminary source pool

- initial query pool (no deduplication): 1643
- snowballing pool (from 29 reviews): 530

6.2 Additional concept research

- utilizing Joanna Briggs Institute JBI Scoping Review methodology

6.3 Preliminary findings income

- potential drivers: (Zhuan2023)
 - inverted-U hypothesis (Kuznets, 1955)/ dual economy model (Lewis, 1954)
 - technological progress
 - globalization
 - deregulation/market-oriented reform
 - financialization
 - population aging

- widening spatial inequality between subsistence/growth economy (i.e. dual economy)
- growing gap to super-rich (top 1 percentile)
- potential channels:
 - declining labor income share/ growing capital income share
 - widening skilled/non-skilled wage differentials
 - growing spatial inequality
 - limited taxation/transfer income redistribution

6.4 Potential additional search terms

- Matthew effect (lower socio-economic position households send fewer children to formal child-care in HIC)
- issue: currently in many cases looking at *health* and *health inequality* outcomes

6.5 Issues raised by ILO

- only english: Query itself is English only. If Spanish/French fall into grid, may include
- no purely qualitative: might prove too much; how to ensure rigour?
- no pre-2000: Can include?

7 Relevant references

- Chang, Y.-S., Harger, L., Beake, S., & Bick, D. (2021). Women’s and Employers’ Experiences and Views of Combining Breastfeeding with a Return to Paid Employment: A Systematic Review of Qualitative Studies. *Journal of Midwifery Womens Health*, 66(5), 641–655. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jmwh.13243>
- DFI. (2023). *A call to action to save SDG10*. Development Finance International.
- Finlay, J. E. (2021). Women’s reproductive health and economic activity: A narrative review. *World Development*, 139. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2020.105313>
- ILO. (2002). *Resolution on decent work and the informal economy*. International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2013). *Resolution concerning statistics of work, employment and labour underutilization*. International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2015). *Recommendation No. 204 concerning the Transition from the Informal to the Formal Economy*. International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2016). *Women at Work Trends 2016*. International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2019). *Working conditions in a global perspective*. International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2021a). *Inequalities and the world of work*. International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2021b). *Resolution concerning inequalities and the world of work*. International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2022a). *Follow-up to the resolution concerning inequalities and the world of work: Comprehensive and integrated ILO strategy to reduce and prevent inequalities in the world of work*. International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2022b). *World Employment and Social Outlook: Trends 2022*. International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2023a). *Guidelines concerning a statistical definition of informal employment*. International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2023b). *The road to decent work for domestic workers*. International Labour Organization.
- ILO. (2023c). *World Employment and Social Outlook: Trends 2023*. International Labour Organization.
- Kalasa, B., Eloundou-Enyegue, P., & Giroux, S. C. (2021). Horizontal versus vertical inequalities: The relative significance of geography versus class in mapping subnational fertility. *The Lancet Global Health*, 9(6), e730–e731. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2214-109X\(21\)00171-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2214-109X(21)00171-6)
- Lettieri, A., & Diez Villoria, E. (2017). A Systematization of the International Evidence Related to Labor Inclusion Barriers and Facilitators for People with Mental Illness A Review of Reviews. *Sociologica-Italian Journal of Sociology on Line*, 3. <https://doi.org/10.2383/89515>
- Nevala, N., Pehkonen, I., Koskela, I., Ruusuvoori, J., & Anttila, H. (2015). Workplace Accommodation Among Persons with Disabilities: A Systematic Review of Its Effectiveness and Barriers or Facilitators. *Journal of Occupational Rehabilitation*, 25(2), 432–448. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s1>

0926-014-9548-z

- Perez, V., Hernandez-Solano, A., Teruel, G., & Reyes, M. (2022). The changing role of employment and alternative income sources among the urban poor: A systematic literature review. *International Journal of Urban Sustainable Development*, *14*(1), 124–143. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19463138.2022.2082444>
- Pinto, A. D., Perri, M., Pedersen, C. L., Aratangy, T., Hapsari, A. P., & Hwang, S. W. (2021). Exploring different methods to evaluate the impact of basic income interventions: A systematic review. *International Journal for Equity in Health*, *20*(142), 142. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12939-021-01479-2>
- Ravallion, M. (2018). Inequality and Globalization: A Review Essay. *Journal of Economic Literature*, *56*(2), 620–642. <https://doi.org/10.1257/jel.20171419>
- Silvaggi, F., Leonardi, M., Raggi, A., Eigenmann, M., Mariniello, A., Silvani, A., Lamperti, E., & Schiavolin, S. (2020). Employment and Work Ability of Persons With Brain Tumors: A Systematic Review. *Frontiers in Human Neuroscience*, *14*. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fnhum.2020.571191>